

EMPLOYEE RELATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

Tuesday, June 27, 2006
Council Chambers

PRESENT: Alds. Krill, Maher, Meaux, Purins, Stepaniak – 5

ALSO PRESENT: B. Aldana, Asst. City Atty./Personnel Admin.; W. Tarman-Ramcheck, Pub. Works Prog. Analyst

Ald. Purins as Chair called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Student clerk/intern position in the public works department

The committee reviewed a request by the Public Works Director for a student clerk/intern to perform the following duties in the public works department: 1) computer work including data entry and reporting; 2) recycling enforcement and record keeping; 3) recycling survey; and 4) recycling information and education.

Moved by Ald. Maher, seconded by Ald. Krill to recommend approval for the student clerk/intern position in the public works department --

Ald. Maher expressed concern about the pay range being too low. Mr. Ramcheck said the pay range is taken from the ordinance pertaining to interns. He noted that in addition to the salary, the student would get credit through his/her college or university.

Ald. Stepaniak said the salary range is potentially very restrictive. He suggested that the pay range not be included in the motion. Ms. Aldana pointed out that the pay range is done by ordinance; however, the committee could deviate from the pay range for this position by resolution. The options would be to address only this position or to amend the ordinance to address all intern positions.

Ald. Krill said that changing the salary range for interns by ordinance might have future ramifications. Ms. Aldana noted that they have had other student interns in other departments for the same pay range listed in the ordinance.

Mr. Ramcheck said that Waukesha County graduate intern salaries range from \$9.76 to \$12.60. Undergraduates make less than graduates.

Ald. Maher offered a friendly amendment that the intern salary for the public works department would not exceed \$10. The amendment was accepted by Ald. Krill. Ald. Maher also thought the committee should address the pay range in the ordinance.

Ms. Aldana advised that from a payroll auditing standpoint they need some other authorization. She indicated that the amendment to the motion language would suffice.

Ald. Stepaniak said that some of the tasks in the intern's job description are more complex. He thought they needed a significant talent to fill this position. He offered a friendly amendment to make the amount not to exceed \$12 per hour. The amendment was accepted by the motioner and the seconder.

Moved by Ald. Maher, seconded by Ald. Krill to recommend approval for the student intern position in the public works department at a salary not to exceed \$12 per hour. Vote on the motion as amended was Ayes: 5, Noes: 0

The selection process for City Administrator

Virchow Krause

Edmund Henschel, Manager, Virchow Krause, said that his firm is a full service auditing and accounting firm. They provide a number of other services such as municipal consulting and recruiting. He is the executive director of the Wisconsin City/County Management Association as well. He noted that the city has worked with Virchow Krause for over 20 years and therefore they have a good idea of what the City of Wauwatosa's needs are. His company is in contact with administrators statewide as well as nationally and they have done a number of city administrator recruitments. They don't believe in a "one size fits all" approach. They use proven selection tools and will work with the city to advertise and screen the candidates. They also summarize candidate interviews, do telephone interviews and recommend candidates. They will provide interview questions. Their staff has people trained in Human Resources. They will also handle the logistics of getting candidates in for interviews. They also provide public relations for the city. He said their typical timetable is approximately 12 weeks depending on publication deadlines. They understand the needs of the community, the needs of the position and the needs of the Common Council. They are convenient and accessible. He noted that they have a large staff with the skills to carry the process forward.

Ald. Stepaniak asked about the pool of candidates. Mr. Henschel said the candidates would be recruited from around the country according to their background and how well they would fit the needs of the city.

Ald. Maher expressed concern about retention and finding the perfect fit for the city. Mr. Henschel said retention is a challenge. He cautioned that in the next few years there will be a large number of city administrator positions open and a smaller pool of candidates.

Ald. Purins asked about the average retention rate. Mr. Henschel said the average retention rate nationally is approximately 6 to 8 years.

Public Administration Associates, LLC

William Frueh, Partner, Public Administration Associates, LLC (PAA), said his firm helped hire the former city administrator in 2000. They do a lot of executive recruitment and administrative searches. He provided the committee with a list of 130 cities that they have assisted over the years. Their methodology is to utilize an extensive network of placing ads. They also have relationships with several schools of Public Administration. They cast a net as wide as possible to get as many candidates as possible. They review the resumes and provide condensed versions to the committee listing pertinent experience and education. They will then recommend the top ten candidates after reviewing the applicants with the committee. They think they have an effective way of determining the best candidates. Candidates are asked to provide a six minute video tape of themselves answering questions. These video tapes are reviewed by the committee. He said that PAA would provide a written report on their reference check results. They will then defer to the committee on the top four candidates. PAA will coordinate the interview process with the city staff and the committee. They will also provide a tour of the city to final candidates and a reception. After that they will do formal interviews. They will also negotiate the employment agreement for the city after the final pick is made.

Mr. Frueh stressed that PAA is the fourth largest firm in the country when it comes to placing city administrators. He added that in the unlikely event that none of the finalist candidates are chosen, PAA will continue the search on behalf of the city at no added cost beyond direct expenses. If within the first year of employment the city administrator resigns or is dismissed for cause, they will conduct another search for direct expense only. There will be no charge for professional services. He said that PAA has never had to do a job over. They believe they are the most qualified firm for the job and they think their process is the most effective. They stay in touch with their

clients when the process is finished. They want the candidate for the job to be a great success and they have a very good track record.

Ald. Maher asked about retention and if any of their candidates had quit during the first year. Mr. Frueh said there were none that he knew of.

Ald. Stepaniak asked about the strengths of being a Wisconsin firm in this field. Mr. Frueh every state has nuances regarding their individual open meetings law. They are very familiar with Wisconsin law and the bulk of the positions they have recruited have been Wisconsin positions.

The PAR Group

Bob Beezat, President, The PAR Group, introduced himself and his associate Jerry Schultz. Mr. Beezat said they believe that a city administrator search is a consensus building process and a very important decision. The process begins with identifying what the Council is looking for. Their process includes interviews with the Council and department heads. The idea is to gather as much information as possible. They are also looking at issues before the city and they begin with a mini-organizational study. The second part of the process involves advertising and recruiting people. They use a variety of publications and in some cases, word of mouth. They identify about 75 to 100 people that would be good prospects. That number is then pared down to 50 candidates. From there the group is narrowed down to 15 to 20 people. They do phone interviews, gather additional information and do background checks. They also make reference calls. They put all the information they gather into a packet for the committee. There are usually about 8 to 10 people they think are best. That number is whittled down to 5 or 6 and at that point an interview schedule is set up. Interviews are evaluated and then 2 or 3 people will be brought back for second interviews the next day.

Mr. Beezat said that with regard to employment contracts, they can put one together or they can let the city's Human Resources department handle that aspect if the Council prefers. They do provide an optional credit check at an additional cost.

Ald. Stepaniak noted that The PAR Group is not Wisconsin based. He asked if they thought that was a competitive advantage. Mr. Beezat said they are a national firm and they work nationally; however, the bulk of their work is in the midwest. That is where most of their candidates come from. They know people in this area on a broader scale and have a broader range of candidates.

Ald. Stepaniak asked about the number of hours involved. Mr. Beezat said they approximate about 100 to 120 hours split between himself and his associate. There are about 30 to 40 hours of reference and background checks.

Ald. Maher asked about retention and whether The PAR Group has been able to recruit people that will remain. He also asked about the difference between city manager and city administrator. Mr. Beezat said that the biggest difference is by statute. Wisconsin has the strongest city manager form. The city manager appoints board and commission members; the city administrator does not. With regard to retention, they believe that the size of the Council does make a difference to candidates. They believe in focusing on what is good for the city. The average tenure in their experience has been about 5 years for a city administrator. They strive to give the best opportunity for the city and candidate to understand each other.

The committee recessed at 7:20 p.m. and reconvened at 7:30 p.m.

Ald. Stepaniak said by way of disclosure, that he is acquainted with Mr. Schultz from The PAR Group and Mr. Ley who works for Virchow Krause although his contact with them was very brief.

Ald. Maher disclosed that he has done some consulting work with PAA.

A discussion followed on the merits of each firm's presentation with the consensus being that PAA would be the firm that could do the best job for the City of Wauwatosa.

Moved by Ald. Krill, seconded by Ald. Stepaniak to retain Public Administration Associates, LLC as the executive search firm for the City of Wauwatosa --

Ald. Maher asked if employee agreement negotiations were better done by the city or through a firm like PAA. Ald. Purins said it was his experience on the school board that it was better to have an outside party do the negotiations. Ms. Aldana said that decision can be made as the process moves along.

Vote on the motion was Ayes: 4, Noes: 0, Present: 1 (Maher)

Ald. Maher suggested that the process start as soon as possible. Ald. Stepaniak said he would like to see the rest of the Council participate as much as possible.

The meeting adjourned at 7:52 p.m.

Carla A. Ledesma, City Clerk
City of Wauwatosa

svh